

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

_____	)	
THOMAS LAUMANN, FERNANDA GARBER,	)	
ROBERT SILVER, and PETER HERMAN,	)	
representing themselves and all others similarly	)	
situated,	)	12-cv-1817 (SAS)
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	
v.	)	
	)	
NATIONAL HOCKEY LEAGUE et al.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	
_____	)	
	)	
FERNANDA GARBER, MARC LERNER,	)	
DEREK RASMUSSEN, and ROBERT SILVER,	)	
representing themselves and all others similarly	)	
situated,	)	12-cv-3704 (SAS)
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	
v.	)	ECF Cases
	)	
OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER OF	)	
BASEBALL, et al.,	)	Electronically Filed
	)	
Defendants.	)	
_____	)	

**DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS THE COMPLAINTS**

Pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Defendants hereby move to dismiss the Complaints in *Laumann et al. v. National Hockey League et al.* and *Garber et al. v. Office of the Commissioner of Baseball et al.* In support of this motion, Defendants submit herewith a Memorandum of Law as well as the Declarations of Paul M. Eckles and Thomas J. Ostertag. Pursuant to the Court's Individual Rules and Procedures, the parties have

exchanged pre-motion letters, but Plaintiffs have declined to withdraw or amend their Complaints.

Dated: July 27, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Shepard Goldfein

Shepard Goldfein

James A. Keyte

Paul M. Eckles

Matthew M. Martino

**SKADDEN, ARPS, SLATE,  
MEAGHER & FLOM LLP**

Four Times Square

New York, New York 10036-6522

Telephone: (212) 735-3000

Facsimile: (212) 735-2000

shepard.goldfein@skadden.com

james.keyte@skadden.com

paul.eckles@skadden.com

matthew.martino@skadden.com

*Attorneys for Defendants National Hockey League,  
NHL Enterprises, L.P., NHL Interactive  
Cyberenterprises, LLC, Chicago Blackhawks  
Hockey Team, Inc., Comcast-Spectacor, L.P.,  
Hockey Western New York LLC, Lemieux Group,  
L.P., Lincoln Hockey LLC, New Jersey Devils LLC,  
New York Islanders Hockey Club, L.P. and San  
Jose Sharks, LLC*

/s/ Bradley I. Ruskin

Bradley I. Ruskin

Helene D. Jaffe

Jennifer R. Scullion

Robert D. Forbes

**PROSKAUER ROSE LLP**

Eleven Times Square

New York, New York 10036-8299

Telephone: (212) 969-3000

Facsimile: (212) 969-2900

bruskin@proskauer.com

hjaffe@proskauer.com

jscullion@proskauer.com

rforbes@proskauer.com

Thomas J. Ostertag

Senior Vice President and General Counsel

Office of the Commissioner of Baseball

245 Park Avenue

New York, New York 10167

Telephone: (212) 931-7855

Facsimile: (212) 949-5653

*Attorneys for Defendants Office of the  
Commissioner of Baseball, Major League  
Baseball Enterprises Inc., MLB Advanced Media  
L.P., MLB Advanced Media, Inc., Athletics  
Investment Group, LLC, The Baseball Club of  
Seattle, L.L.P., Chicago White Sox, Ltd.,  
Colorado Rockies Baseball Club, Ltd., The  
Phillies, Pittsburgh Baseball, Inc., and San  
Francisco Baseball Associates, L.P.*

/s/ Stephen R. Neuwirth

Stephen R. Neuwirth  
Richard I. Werder, Jr.  
Ben M. Harrington  
**QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, LLP**  
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor  
New York, New York 10010  
Telephone: (212) 849-7000  
Facsimile: (212) 849-7100  
stephenneuwirth@quinnemanuel.com  
rickwerder@quinnemanuel.com  
benharrington@quinnemanuel.com

*Attorneys for Defendants The Madison Square  
Garden Company and New York Rangers Hockey  
Club*

/s/ Jonathan D. Schiller

Jonathan D. Schiller  
Alan Vickery  
Christopher Duffy  
**BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP**  
575 Lexington Avenue, 7th Floor  
New York, New York 10022  
Telephone: (212) 446-2300  
Facsimile: (212) 446-2350  
jschiller@bsflp.com  
avickery@bsflp.com  
cduffy@bsflp.com

*Attorneys for Defendants New York Yankees  
Partnership and Yankees Entertainment & Sports  
Network, LLC*

/s/ Louis A. Karasik

Louis A. Karasik  
Drew E. Paris  
**ALSTON & BIRD LLP**  
333 South Hope Street, 16th Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90071-3004  
Telephone: (213) 576-1148  
Facsimile: (213) 576-1100  
lou.karasik@alston.com  
drew.paris@alston.com

*Attorneys for Defendants DIRECTV, LLC,  
DIRECTV Sports Networks, LLC, DIRECTV Sports  
Net Pittsburgh, LLC a/k/a Root Sports Pittsburgh,  
DIRECTV Sports Net Rocky Mountain, LLC a/k/a  
Root Sports Rocky Mountain, and DIRECTV Sports  
Net Northwest, LLC a/k/a Root Sports Northwest*

/s/ Arthur J. Burke

Arthur J. Burke  
James W. Haldin  
**DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL LLP**  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10017  
Telephone: (212) 450-4000  
Facsimile: (212) 701-5800  
arthur.burke@davispolk.com  
james.haldin@davispolk.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Comcast Corporation,  
Comcast SportsNet Philadelphia, L.P., Comcast  
SportsNet Mid-Atlantic L.P., Comcast SportsNet  
California, LLC, and Comcast SportsNet  
Chicago, LLC*